Preparation problems for the discussion sections on October 28th and 30th

**1.** Let 
$$\boldsymbol{u}_1 = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 2 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$$
,  $\boldsymbol{u}_2 = \begin{bmatrix} 2 \\ -1 \\ 2 \end{bmatrix}$ . Let  $\boldsymbol{v} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ -2 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ . Can you find real numbers  $c_1, c_2$  such that  $\boldsymbol{v} = c_1 \boldsymbol{u}_1 + c_2 \boldsymbol{u}_2$ ?

Solution: Since  $\mathbf{u}_1$  and  $\mathbf{u}_2$  are orthogonal (i.e.  $\mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2 = 0$ ), we have that if

 $\mathbf{v} = c_1 \mathbf{u}_1 + c_2 \mathbf{u}_2$ 

for some real number  $c_1, c_2$ , then

$$\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_1 = c_1 \mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_1 + c_2 \mathbf{u}_2 \cdot \mathbf{u}_1 = c_1 \mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_1$$

and

$$\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_2 = c_1 \mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2 + c_2 \mathbf{u}_2 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2 = c_2 \mathbf{u}_2 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2$$

Hence

$$c_1 = \frac{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_1}{\mathbf{u}_1 \cdot \mathbf{u}_1} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\-2\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\2\\0 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\2\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\2\\0 \end{bmatrix}} = -\frac{3}{5}$$

and

$$c_2 = \frac{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{u}_2}{\mathbf{u}_2 \cdot \mathbf{u}_2} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\-2\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 2\\-1\\2 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 2\\-1\\2 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 2\\-1\\2 \end{bmatrix}} = \frac{6}{9} = \frac{2}{3}$$

However, we see that  $-\frac{3}{5}\mathbf{u}_1 + \frac{2}{3}\mathbf{u}_2 \neq \mathbf{v}$ , so it is not possible to find real numbers  $c_1, c_2$  such that  $\mathbf{v} = c_1\mathbf{u}_1 + c_2\mathbf{u}_2$ .

The numbers that we found, however, are "best possible" in the sense that the two sides are as close as possible. In other words,  $-\frac{3}{5}\mathbf{u}_1 + \frac{2}{3}\mathbf{u}_2$  is the orthogonal projection of  $\mathbf{v}$  onto the space spanned by  $\mathbf{u}_1$  and  $\mathbf{u}_2$ .

[Note that you can solve this problem in many other ways. The way above serves to make us more familiar with notions such as orthogonal projections.]

**2.** Let  $W = \text{Span}\{v\}$ , where  $v = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$ , be a subspace of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ . Find the projections  $a_W, b_W, c_W$  of the vectors

$$\boldsymbol{a} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\2\\3 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \boldsymbol{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 2\\-1\\-1 \end{bmatrix}, \quad \boldsymbol{c} = \begin{bmatrix} 2\\2\\2 \end{bmatrix}$$

onto the subspace W. Interpret your results geometrically.

Solution: We have,

$$\mathbf{a}_{W} = \frac{\mathbf{a} \cdot \mathbf{v}}{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v}} \mathbf{v} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\2\\3 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 6\\3\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2\\2\\2\\2 \end{bmatrix},$$
$$\mathbf{b}_{W} = \frac{\mathbf{b} \cdot \mathbf{v}}{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v}} \mathbf{v} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 2\\-1\\-1\\-1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\3\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix},$$
$$\mathbf{c}_{W} = \frac{\mathbf{c} \cdot \mathbf{v}}{\mathbf{v} \cdot \mathbf{v}} \mathbf{v} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 2\\-1\\-1\\-1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\3\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix},$$

The fact that  $\mathbf{b}_W$  is zero means that  $\mathbf{b}$  is orthogonal to W. In this, and the other two cases, we obtain the vector in W which is closest to the vector that we start with.

Solution:

(i) The closest point is the orthogonal projection:



(ii) The projections of the four standard basis vectors are

Hence, the projection matrix is:

$$P = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{3}{4} & -\frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \\ -\frac{1}{4} & \frac{3}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \\ \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \\ \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \end{bmatrix}$$

(iii) Using P, we find that the orthogonal projection is

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\1\\0\\\end{bmatrix}_{W} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{3}{4} & -\frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \\ -\frac{1}{4} & \frac{3}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \\ \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \\ \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} & \frac{1}{4} \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\1\\0\\\end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\\frac{1}{2}\\\frac{1}{2} \end{bmatrix}$$

**4.** Let 
$$W = \text{Span}\left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$$
 and  $V = \text{Span}\left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}, \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$  be subspaces of  $\mathbb{R}^3$ .

- (i) Find the projection matrices, P and Q, corresponding to the projections onto W and V, respectively.
- (ii) Check that PQ = QP. Can you interpret PQ as a projection matrix?

## Solution:

(i) The projections onto W of the three standard basis vectors are

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}_{W} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} + \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{3} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} + \frac{1}{2} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{5}{6}\\-\frac{1}{6}\\\frac{1}{3}\\\frac{1}{3} \end{bmatrix},$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}_{W} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} + \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{3} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} - \frac{1}{2} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} -\frac{1}{6}\\\frac{5}{6}\\\frac{1}{3}\\\frac{1}{3} \end{bmatrix},$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1 \end{bmatrix}_{W} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} + \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{3} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} + 0 \begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{3}\\\frac{1}{3}\\\frac{1}{3} \end{bmatrix}.$$

Hence, the projection matrix corresponding to the orthogonal projection onto W is:

$$P = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{5}{6} & -\frac{1}{6} & \frac{1}{3} \\ -\frac{1}{6} & \frac{5}{6} & \frac{1}{3} \\ \frac{1}{3} & \frac{1}{3} & \frac{1}{3} \end{bmatrix}$$

On the other hand, the projections onto V of the three standard basis vectors are

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}_{V} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} + \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\0\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{3} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} + \frac{1}{6} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{2}\\\frac{1}{2}\\0 \end{bmatrix},$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}_{V} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} + \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\0\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \frac{1}{3} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} + \frac{1}{6} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{2}\\\frac{1}{2}\\\frac{1}{2}\\0 \end{bmatrix},$$

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Hence, the projection matrix corresponding to the orthogonal projection onto V is:

$$P = \begin{bmatrix} \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{2} & 0\\ \frac{1}{2} & \frac{1}{2} & 0\\ 0 & 0 & 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

(ii) PQ = QP is the matrix corresponding to the orthogonal projection onto the intersection of W and V (the space of all vectors in both W and V), that is  $W \cap V = \operatorname{span}\left\{ \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\1\\1 \end{bmatrix} \right\}$ . [Note: since  $\begin{bmatrix} 1\\-1\\0 \end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\-2 \end{bmatrix} = 0$  if you compute orthogonal projection onto W and

then onto V the answer will be same as computing orthogonal projection onto V and then onto W

**5.** Let 
$$A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -1 \\ 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$
 and  $\boldsymbol{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 5 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix}$ .

- **a.** Does **b** belong to the column space of A? Can you solve  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$ ?
- **b.** What do you expect the projection of **b** onto W = Col(A) to be?
- **c.** Find the projection **b** of **b** onto Col(A), and then solve  $A\hat{x} = \hat{b}$ . (The vector  $\hat{x}$  is called the least square solution of  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$ .)
- **d.** Solve the equation  $A^T A \hat{x} = A^T b$ . Compare with your result of the previous part! (This equation is called the normal equation of  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$ .)

**e.** Answer these questions for A as above but with 
$$\boldsymbol{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}$$
 (and then  $\boldsymbol{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\4 \end{bmatrix}$ )

Solution: **a.** No, **b** does not belong to the column operation  $\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\begin{bmatrix} -1\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}$ . Hence there is no solution to  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$ . **b.** W is the span of  $\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}$  and  $\begin{bmatrix} -1\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}$ . It can easily be seen that W is the set of vectors in  $\mathbb{R}^3$ Solution: a. No, b does not belong to the column space of A, because it is not a linear

whose third entry is 0. Hence  $\begin{bmatrix} 4\\5\\0 \end{bmatrix}$  is in W. Note

$$\begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\6 \end{bmatrix} = \mathbf{b} - \begin{bmatrix} 4\\5\\0 \end{bmatrix}$$

is orthogonal to W. Hence  $\begin{bmatrix} 4\\5\\0 \end{bmatrix}$  should be the orthogonal projection of **b** onto W.

Note that the columns of A are an orthogonal basis for W. Hence, we actually know how to compute the orthogonal projection of  $\mathbf{b}$  onto W. The result will be as above, and the computation is given in Step 1 below.]

**c.** Step 1: Find the orthogonal projection of **b** onto W.

$$\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 4\\5\\6\end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix}} + \frac{\begin{bmatrix} 4\\5\\6\end{bmatrix} \cdot \begin{bmatrix} -1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix}}{\begin{bmatrix} -1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix}} \begin{bmatrix} -1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix} = 4.5\begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix} + .5\begin{bmatrix} -1\\1\\0\end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 4\\5\\0\end{bmatrix}$$

Step 2: Solve  $A\widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \widehat{\mathbf{b}}$ .

$$\begin{bmatrix} 1 & -1 & | & 4 \\ 1 & 1 & | & 5 \\ 0 & 0 & | & 0 \end{bmatrix} \xrightarrow{R_2 \to R_2 - R_1} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -1 & | & 4 \\ 0 & 2 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & | & 0 \end{bmatrix} \xrightarrow{R_1 \to R_1 + .5R_2} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & | & 4.5 \\ 0 & 2 & | & 1 \\ 0 & 0 & | & 0 \end{bmatrix}$$
$$\widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 4.5 \\ \mathbf{x} \end{bmatrix}.$$

Hence,

$$\widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 4.5\\.5 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Note that this was unnecessary! When projecting **b** onto W, we already expressed the result as a linear combination of the columns of A.]

**d.** We first calculate  $A^T A$  and  $A^T \mathbf{b}$ :

$$A^{T}A = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 \\ -1 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 1 & -1 \\ 1 & 1 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix},$$
$$A^{T}\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 1 & 0 \\ -1 & 1 & 0 \end{bmatrix} \begin{bmatrix} 4 \\ 5 \\ 6 \end{bmatrix} = \begin{bmatrix} 9 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}.$$

Now we have to solve

$$\begin{bmatrix} 2 & 0 \\ 0 & 2 \end{bmatrix} \widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 9 \\ 1 \end{bmatrix}$$

Clearly, then

$$\widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 4.5\\.5\\.5 \end{bmatrix}.$$

**e.** I leave the details to you, but here are the solutions. For  $\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 1 \\ 1 \\ 0 \end{bmatrix}$ :

$$\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\1\\0 \end{bmatrix}, \widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 1\\0 \end{bmatrix}$$

Note that in this case  $\hat{\mathbf{b}} = \mathbf{b}$  and  $\hat{\mathbf{x}}$  is a solution (not just a least squares solution) of  $A\mathbf{x} = \mathbf{b}$ .

For 
$$\mathbf{b} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\4 \end{bmatrix}$$
:  
 $\widehat{\mathbf{b}} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0\\0 \end{bmatrix}, \widehat{\mathbf{x}} = \begin{bmatrix} 0\\0 \end{bmatrix}$ 

This was to be expected because **b** is orthogonal to the columns of A.